

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

-----X  
VIRGINIA L. GIUFFRE,  
Plaintiff,  
v.  
GHISLAINE MAXWELL,  
Defendant.  
-----X

15-cv-07433-RWS

**Memorandum of Law in Support of Defendant's  
Motion for Summary Judgment**

Laura A. Menninger  
Jeffrey S. Pagliuca  
HADDON, MORGAN, AND FOREMAN, P.C.  
150 East 10<sup>th</sup> Avenue  
Denver, CO 80203  
303.831.7364

## TABLE OF CONENTS

PRELIMINARY STATEMENT .....	1
FACTS .....	1
SUMMARY JUDGMENT STANDARD .....	10
ARGUMENT .....	12
I. Ms. Maxwell is not liable for republications of her January 2015 statement that she did not authorize or request and by entities she did not control. ....	12
A. Summary judgment is warranted to the extent plaintiff seeks to impose liability on any media’s republication of all or a portion of the January 2015 statement. ....	12
B. Because plaintiff is a limited public figure, imposing liability upon Ms. Maxwell for republication of the January 2015 statement would violate the First Amendment. ....	16
C. Plaintiff should be barred from introducing into evidence any republication of an excerpt from the January 2015 statement. ....	17
II. Summary judgment is warranted under the New York Constitution. ....	18
A. The January 2015 statement constitutes nonactionable opinion. ....	18
B. In this Rule 56 proceeding, this Court’s Rule 12(b)(6) opinion does not control the question of law whether the January 2015 statement constitutes nonactionable opinion. ....	31
III. The pre-litigation privilege bars this action. ....	33
IV. Ms. Maxwell’s January 4, 2015, statement is nonactionable. ....	38
V. The defamation claim should be dismissed because the publication is substantially true. ...	39
VI. Plaintiff cannot establish actual malice by clear and convincing evidence. ....	40
A. Facts. ....	40
B. Plaintiff carries the burden of proving actual malice by clear and convincing evidence. ....	48
C. Plaintiff is a public figure who must prove actual malice. ....	49
1. Plaintiff successfully invited public attention to influence others. ....	51

2.	Plaintiff voluntarily injected herself into public controversies related to the subject of this litigation.....	53
3.	Plaintiff assumed a position of prominence in the public controversies. .	53
4.	Plaintiff has maintained regular and continuing access to the media. ....	54
D.	Plaintiff must also prove actual malice to overcome the defenses of reply and pre-litigation privilege. ....	54
E.	The January 2015 statement was substantially true, and plaintiff cannot produce clear and convincing evidence of its falsity. ....	56
1.	The January 2015 statement accurately denied that Ms. Maxwell met Plaintiff when Plaintiff was 15 years old in 1999.....	56
2.	The January 2015 statement accurately denied that Ms. Maxwell “regularly participate[d] in Epstein’s sexual exploitation of minors” and that “the Government knows” such fact. ....	58
3.	The January 2015 statement accurately denied that “with [Ms. Maxwell’s] assistance, [Epstein] converted [Plaintiff] into what is commonly referred to as a ‘sex slave.’” ....	59
4.	The January 2015 statement accurately reported that Plaintiff alleged “sexual relations” with Professor Dershowitz which he denied. ....	60
5.	The January 2015 statement accurately denied that Ms. Maxwell created and distributed child pornography and that the Government knows of and possesses such child pornography. ....	62
6.	January 2015 statement accurately denied Maxwell acted as “madame” for Epstein to traffic Plaintiff to the rich and famous.....	63
CONCLUSION.....		68
CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE .....		70

## TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

### Cases

<i>Adelson v. Harris</i> , 973 F. Supp. 2d 467, 490 (S.D.N.Y. 2013).....	29
<i>Air Wisconsin Airlines Corp. v. Hoeper</i> , 134 S. Ct. 852, 861 (2014) .....	48
<i>Anderson v. Liberty Lobby, Inc.</i> , 477 U.S. 242, 251-52 (1986). ....	11
<i>Aronson v. Wiersma</i> , 483 N.E.2d 1138, 1139 (1985) .....	22,24
<i>Bartnicki v. Vopper</i> , 532 U.S. 514, 535 (2001).....	48
<i>Biro v. Condé Nast</i> , 883 F. Supp. 2d 441, 458 (S.D.N.Y. 2012) .....	39
<i>Biro v. Condé Naste</i> , 963 F. Supp. 2d 255, 269 (S.D.N.Y. 2013).....	49
<i>Black v. Green Harbour Homeowners’ Ass’n</i> , 798 N.Y.S.2d 753 (App. Div. 2005), .....	34
<i>Celle v. Filipino Reporter Enters. Inc.</i> , 209 F.3d 163, 176-77 (2d Cir. 2000).....	51
<i>Celotex Corp. v. Catrett</i> , 477 U.S. 317, 322 (1986).....	12
<i>Chambers v. Wells Fargo Bank, N.A.</i> , No. 2016 WL 3533998, at *8 (D.N.J. June 28, 2016) .....	33
<i>Chau v. Lewis</i> , 935 F. Supp. 2d 644, 665 (S.D.N.Y. 2013) .....	23
<i>Collier v. Postum Cereal Co.</i> , 134 N.Y.S. 847, 853 (1 <sup>st</sup> Dep't 1912) .....	55
<i>Contemporary Mission, Inc. v. N.Y. Times Co.</i> , 842 F.2d 612, 617 (2d Cir. 1988).....	50
<i>Curtis Publ'g Co. v. Butts</i> , 388 U.S. 130 (1967) .....	49
<i>Davis v. Boenheim</i> , 22 N.E.3d 999, 1006 (N.Y. 2014) .....	22,31
<i>Davis v. Costa-Gavras</i> , 580 F. Supp. 1082, 1096 (S.D.N.Y. 1984) .....	12
<i>Dibella v. Hopkins</i> , No. 01 CIV. 11779 (DC), 2002 WL 31427362, at *2 (S.D.N.Y. Oct. 30, 2002).....	23
<i>Don King Prods., Inc. v. Douglas</i> , 742 F. Supp. 778, 780 (S.D.N.Y. 1990) .....	11

<i>Elias v. Rolling Stone LLC</i> , No. 15-CV-5953 (PKC), 2016 WL 3583080, at *6 (S.D.N.Y. June 28, 2016).....	22
<i>Enigma Software Grp. USA, LLC v. Bleeping Computer LLC</i> , No. 16 CIV. 57 (PAE), 2016 WL 3773394, at *11 (S.D.N.Y. July 8, 2016).....	19
<i>Faigin v. Kelly</i> , 978 F. Supp. 420, 426 (D. N.H. 1997).....	50
<i>Firestone v. Time, Inc.</i> , 271 So. 2d 745, 752 (Fla. 1972).....	13
<i>Fleckenstein v. Friedman</i> , 193 N.E. 537, 538 (N.Y. 1934) .....	40
<i>Flomenhaft v. Finkelstein</i> , 8 N.Y.S.3d 161, 164 n.2 (1 <sup>st</sup> Dep't 2015) .....	33
<i>Folwell v. Miller</i> , 145 F. 495, 497 (2d Cir. 1906) .....	13
<i>Franklin v. Daily Holdings, Inc.</i> , 21 N.Y.S.3d 6, 12 (App. Div. 2015).....	39
<i>Frechtman v. Gutternan</i> , 979 N.Y.S. 2d 58 (App. Div. 2014) .....	34
<i>Front, Inc. v. Khalil</i> , 28 N.E.3d 15, 16 (N.Y. 2015) .....	33
<i>Geraci v. Probst</i> , 938 N.E.2d 917, 921 (N.Y. 2010).....	13,18
<i>Germain v. M &amp; T Bank Corp.</i> , 111 F. Supp. 3d 506, 534 (S.D.N.Y. 2015).....	19
<i>Gertz v. Robert Welch, Inc.</i> , 418 U.S. 323 (1974).....	16, 48, 49
<i>Goforth v. Avemco Life Ins. Co.</i> , 368 F.2d 25, 28 n.7 (4th Cir.1966). .....	39
<i>Goldstein v. Cogswell</i> , No. 85 CIV. 9256 (KMW), 1992 WL 131723, at *27 n.32 (S.D.N.Y. June 1, 1992) .....	33
<i>Gross v. New York Times</i> , 623 N.E.2d 1163, 1169 (N.Y. 1993).....	28
<i>Harte-Hanks Communic'ns, Inc. v. Connaughton</i> , 491 U.S. 657, 666 n.7 (1989) .....	48
<i>Hawkins v. Harris</i> , 661 A.2d 284, 289-91 (N.J. 1995) .....	33
<i>Horne v. Matthews</i> , No. 97 Civ. 3605(JSM), 1997 WL 598452 (S.D.N.Y. Sept. 25, 1997) .....	23
<i>Huggins v. Moore</i> , 726 N.E.2d 456, 460 (N.Y. 1999) .....	48

<i>Immuno AG v. Moor-Jankowski</i> , 567 N.E.2d 1270, 1282 (N.Y. 1991) .....	11, 19
<i>Indep. Living Aids, Inc. v. Maxi-Aids, Inc.</i> , 981 F. Supp. 124, 128 (E.D.N.Y. 1997).....	28
<i>International Publishing Concepts, LLC v. Locatelli</i> .....	37
<i>James v. Gannett Co.</i> , 353 N.E.2d 834, 838 (N.Y. 1976) .....	14, 23, 49
<i>Jewell v. NYP Holdings, Inc.</i> , 23 F. Supp. 2d 348, 366 (S.D.N.Y.1998).....	40
<i>Kane v. Orange Cnty. Publ'ns</i> , 649 N.Y.S.2d 23, 26 (App. Div. 1996) .....	56
<i>Karaduman v. Newsday, Inc.</i> , 416 N.E.2d 557, 560 (1980).....	18
<i>Kirk v. Heppt</i> , 532 F. Supp. 2d 586, 593 (S.D.N.Y. 2008). ....	33
<i>Klein v. McGauley</i> , 29. A.D.2d 418, 420 (2 <sup>nd</sup> Dep't 1968) .....	34
<i>Lehman Bros. Commercial Corp. v. Minmetals Int'l Non-Ferrous Metals Trading Co.</i> , No. 94 CIV. 8301(JFK), 1995 WL 380119, at *6 n.2 (S.D.N.Y. June 26, 1995).....	21
<i>Lerman v. Flynt Dist. Co., Inc.</i> , 745 F.3d 123, 136 (2d Cir. 1984).....	49
<i>Mann v. Abel</i> , 885 N.E.2d 884, 885-86 (N.Y. 2008) .....	29
<i>Martin v. City of Oceanside</i> , 205 F. Supp. 2d 1142, 1147 (S.D. Cal. 2002), <i>aff'd</i> , 360 F.3d 1078 (9 <sup>th</sup> Cir. 2004).. ....	22
<i>Martirano v. Frost</i> , 255 N.E.2d 693 (1969).....	34
<i>Mashburn v. Collin</i> , 355 So. 2d 879, 885 (La. 1977).....	30
<i>Masson v. New Yorker Magazine, Inc.</i> , 501 U.S. 496, 510 (1991) .....	54
<i>Maule v. Philadelphia Media Holdings, LLC</i> , No. CIV.A. 08-3357, 2010 WL 914926, at *10 (E.D. Pa. Mar. 15, 2010) .....	22
<i>McGill v. Parker</i> , 582 N.Y.S.2d 91, 97 (App. Div. 1992) .....	48
<i>Meiri v. Dacon</i> , 759 F.2d 989, 998 (2d Cir. 1985).....	11
<i>Mencher v. Chesley</i> , 75 N.E.2d 257, 259 (N.Y. 1947).....	14
<i>Milkovich v. Lorain Journal Co.</i> , 497 U.S. 1 (1990) .....	19

<i>New York Times Co. v. Sullivan</i> , 376 U.S. 254 (1964) .....	16,48,49
<i>People v. Kocsis</i> , 28 N.Y.S.3d 466, 471 (App. Div. 2016) .....	21
<i>Petrus v. Smith</i> , 91 A.D.2d 1190, 1191 (N.Y. App. Div. 1983).....	34
<i>Philadelphia Newspapers, Inc. v. Hepps</i> , 475 U.S. 767, 776-77 (1986).....	48
<i>In Re Philadelphia Newspapers, LLC</i> , 690 F.3d 161, 175 (3d Cir. 2012), <i>as corrected</i> (Oct. 25, 2012).....	39
<i>Rand v. New York Times Co.</i> , 430 N.Y.S.2d 271, 275 (App. Div. 1980). ....	14
<i>Ratajack v. Brewster Fire Dep’t, Inc. of the Brewster-SE Joint Fire Dist.</i> , 178 F. Supp. 3d 118, 158 (S.D.N.Y. 2016).....	29
<i>Rinaldi v. Viking Penguin, Inc.</i> , 420 N.E.2d 377, 382 (N.Y. 1981).....	13
<i>Salyer v. S. Poverty Law Ctr., Inc.</i> , 701 F. Supp. 2d 912, 916 (W.D. Ky. 2009) .....	39
<i>Sexter v. Warmflash, P.C. v. Margrabe</i> , 828 N.Y.S. 2d 315 (App. Div. 2007)).....	34
<i>Shenkman v. O’Malley</i> , 157 N.Y.S.2d 290, 294, 297 (App. Div. 1956).....	54
<i>Soley v. Wasserman</i> , No. 8 CIV. 9262 KMW FM, 2013 WL 3185555, at *8 (S.D.N.Y. June 21, 2013).....	18
<i>Steinhilber v. Alphonse</i> , 501 N.E.2d 550, 550 (N.Y. 1986) .....	19
<i>Time, Inc. v. Firestone</i> , 424 U.S. 448, 488 n.1 (1976) .....	13
<i>Waldbaum v. Fairchild Publ’ns, Inc.</i> , 626 F.2d 1287, 1298 (D.C. Cir. 1980 .....	51
<b>Rules</b>	
Fed. R. Civ. P. 56.....	11, 12

**PAGES 1-68 REDACTED**



January 6, 2017.

Respectfully submitted,

*/s/ Laura A. Menninger*

---

Laura A. Menninger (LM-1374)

Jeffrey S. Pagliuca (*pro hac vice*)

HADDON, MORGAN AND FOREMAN, P.C.

150 East 10<sup>th</sup> Avenue

Denver, CO 80203

Phone: 303.831.7364

Fax: 303.832.2628

lmenninger@hmflaw.com

*Attorneys for Defendant Ghislaine Maxwell*

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that on January 6, 2017, I electronically served this *Memorandum in Support of Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment* via ECF on the following:

Sigrid S. McCawley  
Meredith Schultz  
BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER, LLP  
401 East Las Olas Boulevard, Ste. 1200  
Ft. Lauderdale, FL 33301  
smccawley@bsfllp.com  
mschultz@bsfllp.com

Bradley J. Edwards  
Farmer, Jaffe, Weissing, Edwards, Fistos &  
Lehrman, P.L.  
425 North Andrews Ave., Ste. 2  
Ft. Lauderdale, FL 33301  
brad@pathtojustice.com

Paul G. Cassell  
383 S. University Street  
Salt Lake City, UT 84112  
cassellp@law.utah.edu

J. Stanley Pottinger  
49 Twin Lakes Rd.  
South Salem, NY 10590  
StanPottinger@aol.com

/s/ Nicole Simmons  
Nicole Simmons